

Planning Committee  
3 October 2024

Planning Application  
Number: 24/01091/LBA

**24/01091/LBA - Bourne Hall, Spring Street, Ewell, Surrey, KT17 1UD**

<b>Application Number</b>	24/01091/LBA
<b>Application Type</b>	Listed Building Consent
<b>Address</b>	Bourne Hall, Spring Street, Ewell KT17 1UD
<b>Ward</b>	Ewell Village
<b>Proposal</b>	Alterations to fenestration.
<b>Expiry Date</b>	14 October 2024
<b>Recommendation</b>	Approval, subject to conditions and informatives
<b>Number of Submissions</b>	0
<b>Reason for Committee</b>	Council application
<b>Case Officer</b>	George Smale, Planning Officer
<b>Contact Officer</b>	Simon Taylor, Interim Manager
<b>Plans, Documents and Submissions</b>	Available at <a href="#">Bourne Hall</a> .
<b>Glossary of Terms</b>	Found at the following link: <a href="#">Glossary of Terms</a>



## SUMMARY

### 1. Summary and Recommendation

- 1.1. This application is before the committee as the site is located on Council owned land and the applicant is a representative on behalf of the Council. It is recommended for approval.
- 1.2. This is a proposal for Listed Building Consent for the replacement of all the single-glazed windows on the building with double glazed windows. The existing ground floor door fenestration will also be replaced with double glazing.
- 1.3. The site is owned by the Council and enables several leisure, parkland and open space, and community uses. The site is also located in the Ewell Village Conservation Area. Bourne Hall comprises of a 1960s library, social centre, and museum with modernist architectural merit.
- 1.4. There is an extensive planning history to the wider site and parkland. However, the only recent history for the hall itself has involved permitted works to doors and light fittings, the installation of Solar Panels (under consideration), and alterations to fenestration (under consideration).
- 1.5. The Council's Conservation Officer raises objection to the proposal, concluding that the development will result in less than substantial harm to the listed asset. However, the environmental and economic benefits (namely energy efficiency and cost savings) of the scheme outweigh such harm.
- 1.6. As such, the recommendation before the committee is that the application should be approved subject to conditions.

## PROPOSAL

### 2. Description of Proposal

- 2.1. The proposal involves the following ground floor works:
  - The replacement of single glazed aluminium framed fixed and pivot windows and door with aluminium framed sealed double-glazed units with anodized finish.
  - The existing layout and pattern of openings will match existing but there will be a replacement of the central pivot operation with a bottom hung tilt operation.
  - The single door will be replaced in matching operation to existing.
  - All linings and relative fixing positions within the structural frame will be maintained.
- 2.2. The proposal involves the following first floor works:

- The replacement of single glazed aluminium framed fixed windows with aluminium framed sealed double-glazed units in anodized finish to match the existing layout and pattern of openings.
- All linings and relative fixing positions within the structural frame will be maintained.

## SITE

### 3. Description

- 3.1. Bourne Hall is a large dome-shaped building of a distinctive and striking architectural style, serving as Library and Social Centre since 1970. The building is Grade II Listed, council owned, and centred within Bourne Hall Park. The entire site has important local community value.
- 3.2. The exterior of the building is a curving volume with a continuous band of aluminium windows at first and second floor level. The upper floor slopes inward and the structure is surmounted by a broad copper dome, resembling the appearance of a flying saucer. A circular layout is planned within the building that expands over three level which includes a main hall, open-plan library, mezzanine museum, and studio spaces.
- 3.3. The surrounding area comprises a large open parkland with a number of large redwood trees, green spaces, and water courses. The entire site area is located in the Ewell Village Conservation Area, a historic area encompassing Bourne Hall, the commercial village centre, and outlying residential areas.
- 3.4. The site is accessed by vehicle from Spring Street, and pedestrian routes can be found through the park to the north and from the High Street to the East. The nearest residential properties are located on the western side of Spring Street, approximately 36m from the outer edge of Bourne Hall.

### 4. Constraints

- Built Up Area
- Grade II Listed Building
- Ewell Village Conservation Area
- Article 4 Directive
- Locally Listed Building
- SSSI Impact Risk Zones
- Great Crested Newt Consultation Zone
- Tree Inspections
- Source Protection Zones

### 5. History

- 5.1. The following recent applications are relevant:

App No.	Description	Status
24/01015/LBA	Installation of Solar PV to flat roofs and Tesla Powerwall batteries for power storage.	Pending consideration
24/01013/FUL	Installation of Solar PV to flat roofs and Tesla Powerwall batteries for power storage.	Pending consideration
24/00618/LBA	Listed Building Consent: Installation of new layer of roof felt to the existing felt roof (retrospective)	Pending consideration
24/00064/LBA	Listed Building Consent: Install Solar PV to the south facing section of the perimeter flat roof	Permitted 13 June 2024
24/00419/FUL	Install Solar PV to the south facing section of the perimeter flat roof	Permitted 13 June 2024
24/00066/LBA	Listed Building Consent: Replacement of 13 internal fire doors to meet BS guidelines.	Permitted 13 June 2024
18/01247/LBA	Replacement of 6 internal doors.	Permitted 15 February 2019
17/00445/LBA	Listed Building Consent for proposed replacement of existing light fittings with LED light fittings in Museum and Library areas of Grade II listed building.	Permitted 15 September 2017

## CONSULTATIONS

Consultee	Comments
<b>Internal Consultees</b>	
Conservation Officer	Concerns raised that the replacement windows would harm the character and appearance of the Listed Building.
<b>Public Consultation</b>	
Neighbours	The application was advertised by means of a site notice and press notice, concluding on 20 September 2024. No submissions were received.

## PLANNING LEGISLATION, POLICY, AND GUIDANCE

### 6. Legislation and Regulations

- 6.1. Town and Country Planning Act 1990
- 6.2. Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

### 7. Planning Policy

- 7.1. National Planning Policy Framework 2023 (NPPF)
  - Section 2: Achieving Sustainable Development
  - Section 16: Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment

- 7.2. Epsom and Ewell Core Strategy 2007 (CS)
  - Policy CS1: Sustainable Development
  - Policy CS5: The Built Environment
- 7.3. Epsom and Ewell Development Management Policies Document 2015 (DMPD)
  - Policy DM8: Heritage Assets

## 8. Supporting Guidance

- 8.1. National Planning Policy Guidance (NPPG)
  - Historic Environment
  - Use of Planning Conditions
- 8.2. Supplementary Planning Documents and Guidance
  - Sustainable Design Supplementary Planning Document 2016
- 8.3. Other Documentation
  - Ewell Village Character Appraisal
  - [Historic England Official List](#)

## PLANNING ASSESSMENT

### 9. Listed Significance

- 9.1. Bourne Hall has been Grade II Listed by national government since 30 April 2015. The principal justifications for the listing of the building are taken from the official Historic England Listing:
  - Bourne Hall Library and Social Centre of 1967 – 1970 A. G. Sheppard Fidler and Associates
  - Architectural interest- a striking design, notable for its space-age flair and the generous, top-lit principal interior space.
  - Plan form: the circular layout is well-organised, legible, and flexible;
  - Historic interest: as an ambitious example of the expansion of the library service and the integration of community facilities and disabled access.

- 9.2. The following paragraphs from the list description are also relevant:

*“MATERIALS / STRUCTURE: the structure is of reinforced and pre-cast concrete, with aluminium windows, green Cumbrian slate copings and mosaic external finishes to the perimeter wall. The copper-clad dome with its central glassfibre rooflight is 42.6m (140') in diameter and 11.2m (37') at its highest point. 20 vertical pre-cast concrete ribs form a corona. The knuckles of the ribs are held in position by an in-situ pre-stressed, post-tensioned concrete ring beam which forms both the gutter and the eaves for the main dome. The roof construction is a sandwich of materials: the outer layer is sheet copper bonded to felt and wood wool panels on steel*

*joints spanning between the frame. Towards the outer edges of the roof the wood wool panels are replaced by a band of lightweight 'Gunite' concrete sprayed onto permanent formwork."*

*EXTERIOR: the exterior is a curving volume with a continuous band of aluminium windows at ground and first floor. The upper floor slopes inward and is surmounted by a broad copper dome, from which emerges a corona of pre-stressed, post-tensioned concrete ribs. Single-storey volumes of varying widths project forward of the circular footprint. The windows are separated by load-bearing pre-cast white concrete mullions running between a floating plinth and fascia, and some windows have Cumbrian slate panels beneath. The elevations are designed to a 4" (c.10cm) module enabling standardised pre-cast components. The result resembles a flying saucer and was designed to sit low within the existing mature landscape. The ribbed concrete boiler chimney is 12.8m (42') high and provides a vertical counterpart to the library's dome.*

## **10. Impact on the Heritage Asset**

- 10.1. Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires the council to "have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses."
- 10.2. Paragraphs 203-208 of the NPPF 2023 requires consideration of the harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset. Paragraph 195 says heritage assets are an irreplaceable resource and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of existing and future generation.
- 10.3. Paragraph 206 requires clear and convincing justification where there is harm to or the loss of a designated heritage asset. Paragraph 202 states that where there is less than substantial harm, the harm must be weighed against the public benefits.
- 10.4. Policy CS5 of the CS and Policy DM8 of the DMPD seek to protect and enhance heritage assets and their setting.
- 10.5. The proposal involves the entire replacement of the ground floor windows and door and first floor windows. The existing thermally inefficient windows comprise a mix of centre hung pivot windows and a single hung door. The fenestration will be replaced with 24mm sealed double glazed units set in thermally broken aluminium frames.
- 10.6. The supplier and installer of the Smarts System Alitherm Heritage Aluminium range have recommended that the proposed replacement windows are a close match to the face, width and detail of the existing frames, however the existing centre pivot mechanism used in opening the window is not possible to replicate without resorting to a much wider frame to the face profile or proposing expensive steel frames which would

not match the existing anodized finish or the fabricated appearance characteristic of aluminium.

- 10.7. The barrel type trickle vent (a small opening in a window or door that allows fresh air to circulate into a room while allowing polluted air to escape) would be replaced with an anodized finish glass fitted vent. All linings and relative fixing positions within the structural frame are proposed to be maintained.
- 10.8. The applicant's heritage statement concedes that although the proposal will involve the loss of some historic features, namely the pivot mechanism and the barrel type trickle vents, the replacement windows and door have been designed to replicate the appearance of the original units as closely as possible whilst also enhancing their thermal performance and maintenance requirements.
- 10.9. The EEBC Conservation Officer has raised a primary concern with the loss of the historic pivot mechanism of the existing windows. The original windows are a key feature of the listed building, and these important features would not be preserved in this scheme. The proposal has taken no opportunities to enhance the special features of the listed building which it could have done by removing the unsightly vents and louvres. More specifically, there is less than substantial harm to the heritage asset and the character of the conservation area for the following reasons:
  - The central, horizontal pivoting opening mechanism is a key feature of the windows and the listed building. This allows windows to be opened horizontally allowing fresh air to enter from the bottom opening and foul air to escape from the top. The replacement windows will be full height opening windows which will have a different appearance to the originals which would fail to replicate this key feature of the listed building.
  - The existing and proposed sections will not have the same appearance. Whereas the existing frame profile is straight and square sectioned, the proposed is thinner near the wall, then wider, and has a gap. These features are modernising and fail to achieve the high quality of the sleek design created by the original architects.
  - The proposed elevations show vents installed in the window glass and this is a lost opportunity to improve the ventilation and remove these features.
  - Original barrel trickle vents will be lost which is regrettable as an original and interestingly designed feature. Details of new trickle vents are given in a brochure, but not drawn onto a scale drawing. Their impact should be minimised. It would have been better to design background ventilation in another way.
  - There is no information on window handles, glass, or any other window furniture.
  - If the glass is coloured or has an unattractive visual distortion, this would be harmful. The colour of the window frames can be matched acceptably, but this must be conditioned.

- 10.10. Given the less than substantial harm, is therefore necessary to weigh the scheme against the public benefits of the proposal.
- 10.11. The heritage statement gives the following benefit: “the enhancement of the thermal performance and heat load (and therefore cost of heating) of the public building, which is considered to be in the public benefit in order to ensure the building remains in an economically viable public use.”
- 10.12. The proposal will still generate significant infrastructure contributions to improve the thermal efficiency of the building and reducing heat loss, and ensuring cost effective measures to reduce maintenance, allowing redistribution into more appropriate areas.
- 10.13. These environmental and minor economic benefits would outweigh the less than substantial harm to the Grade II Listed Asset and Ewell Village Conservation Area, and on this basis, the development is acceptable. However, detailed specifications are required including how the pivot plates are applied to the centre of frames, inside and outside, to imitate the original opening method and thereafter maintained in perpetuity alongside details of the frame finish, glass, window furniture, colour and finish of the spacer inside the double-glazed unit and a scale elevation drawing of a proposed window showing location and extent of trickle vent

## **11. Design and Character**

- 11.1. Paragraphs 129, 135 and 139 of the NPPF 2023 refer to the need for functional and visually attractive development that is sympathetic to local character and history. Policy CS5 of the CS requires high quality design that is attractive, relates to local distinctiveness and complements the attractive characteristics of the area. Policy DM9 of the DMPD requires a positive contribution to and compatibility with the local character and the historic and natural environment and Policy DM10 requires good design that respects, maintains or enhances the prevailing house types and sizes, density, scale, layout, height, form and massing, plot width and building separation, building lines and key features.
- 11.2. The design of the windows will match the aluminium characteristic and anodized finish of the existing. Outside of the heritage considerations outlined in Section 10, the proposal will not result in detrimental harm to the visual amenity and local character of the historic environment.
- 11.3. The development will serve a functional purpose of improving insulation and energy efficiency within the building. Heat savings of between 10% to 20% from the window replacement are expected which would result in a substantial reduction in carbon emissions for the whole building.

## **12. Accessibility and Equality**



- 12.1. The Council is required to have regard to its obligations under the Equality Act 2010, including protected characteristics of age, disability, gender, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion, or belief. There would be no significant adverse impacts as a result of the development.

## CONCLUSION

### 13. Planning Balance

- 13.1. The proposed replacement of the existing fenestration and door with will result in less than substantial harm to the Grade II Listed Asset. However, this harm is outweighed by the public benefits of the development and the application is supported.

## RECOMMENDATION

**To grant listed building consent subject to the following conditions and informatives:**

### Conditions

#### 1) Timescale

The development hereby permitted shall be commenced within three years from the date of this decision.

Reason: To comply with Section 18 (1) (a) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended by Section 52 (4) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

#### 2) Approved Plans

Unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority, the development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the plans numbered/titled:

- Detail 1A
- Detail 1E
- Detail 2A
- Detail 3A
- Detail 19A
- Ground Floor Fixed Windows Existing and Proposed
- First Floor Fixed Windows Existing and Proposed
- Ground Floor Pivot Windows Existing and Proposed
- Proposed Elevations 1 of 3
- Proposed Elevations 2 of 3
- Proposed Elevations 3 of 3

- Windows Survey Details

All received by the local planning authority on 19 August 2024.

Reason: For avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved plans and to ensure a satisfactory external appearance in accordance with Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy 2007 and Policies DM8, DM9 and DM10 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015.

### **3) Materials**

Prior to the commencement of the development hereby permitted, detailed specifications of the windows shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. These shall include

- Frame finish (sample)
- Glass (sample)
- Window furniture
- Location and extent of trickle vent (drawing at scale of 1:20)
- Colour and finish of the spacer inside the double glazed unit
- Pivot plates

The approved details shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority.

Reason: To ensure a satisfactory external appearance in accordance with Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Document 2023, Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy 2007 and Policy DM8 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015.

### **4) Pivot Plates**

Prior to first use of the windows, pivot plates are to be applied to the centre of each respective window frame, inside and outside, to imitate the original opening method and thereafter maintained in perpetuity.

Reason: To ensure a satisfactory external appearance in accordance with Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Document 2023, Policy CS5 of the Core Strategy 2007 and Policy DM8 of the Development Management Policies Document 2015.

## **Informatives**

### **1) Positive and Proactive Discussion**

In dealing with the application the Council has implemented the requirement in the National Planning Policy Framework to work with the applicant in a positive and proactive way. We have made available detailed advice in the form of our statutory policies in the Core Strategy, Supplementary Planning Documents,

Planning Briefs and other informal written guidance, as well as offering a full pre-application advice service, in order to ensure that the applicant has been given every opportunity to submit an application which is likely to be considered favourably.

**2) Conservation of the Listed Buildings**

You are reminded that all works to a listed building must be carried out with the utmost care and to the highest standards of quality and workmanship. Any damage to the listed building shall be immediately made good using materials to match the originals. Unauthorised works that harm the listed building constitute a criminal offence and will be liable to fines of up to £20,000 per offence.